

Ruling Genk 1 – Phenix 2 (1 Nat) of 2 December 2017

Board 21 N/NS

	♠ 10 2	
	♥ Q 2	
	♦ A Q 5 2	
	♣ Q T 7 6 3	
♠ 4		♠ A K Q 9 6 5
♥ A K 9 6 5		♥ 8 4 3
♦ J 8 7 6 3		♦ 9
♣ 9 5		♣ A J 2
	♠ J 8 7 3	
	♥ J 10 7	
	♦ K 10 4	
	♣ K 8 4	

Facts

Bidding unknown

East is declarer in a 4♠ contract

When the board was played both teams apparently noted -50 (one down) for EW, and at the end of the session agreed on all scores before leaving the table. When comparing the score sheets with his team mates declarer realized he did make the contract. As one of the players of Team A did not remember what really happened and the other had left no consent was reached.

According to Team B one player of Team A was willing to accept the correction, whereas another refused.

Play according to East

Lead ♥J won by ♥A

♠A, ♠K, ♠Q and small ♠

♥8 ducked and won in North by ♥Q

North plays ♦A and then small ♦ (admitted on the phone by opponent), ruffed by East.

Declarer plays trump and claims (not specified in the statement how many tricks he claimed nor his line of play).

Asked by email what happened at the table North answered he could not remember, but that he thought East had claimed for one down as South held ♠J fourth.

South answered he was sure that declarer did not play trumps a fourth time.

Law 79B3 says: *"If the Director is not called before the round ends, the score may be changed for both sides only when he is clearly convinced as to the result obtained at the table. Otherwise he should either allow the recorded score to stand, or decrease the score for one side without increasing it for the other."*

The National Teams Regulations of the RBBF say

Sectie 42.02 Betwistingen over een resultaat

Betwistingen over het resultaat van een gift of van de wedstrijd dienen op het wedstrijdblad vermeld te worden. De CL zal de betwisting, eventueel in overleg met de WL, onderzoeken en zijn beslissing

daaromtrent aan beide kapiteins meedelen. Indien één van de kapiteins niet akkoord gaat met de beslissing, kan hij hiertegen in beroep gaan volgens de procedure omschreven in artikel 56

Section 42.02 Contestations à propos d'un résultat

Les contestations à propos du résultat d'une donne ou d'une rencontre doivent être signalées sur la feuille de match. Le DC va examiner les contestations, éventuellement en concertation avec l'arbitre, et il communiquera sa décision à ce sujet aux deux capitaines. Si l'un des capitaines n'est pas d'accord avec la décision, il peut aller en appel selon la procédure décrite à l'article 56.

Decision

The score on board 21 that was written on score sheet and which was agreed upon at the table by both teams stands.

Paul Meerbergen
TD

Thierry Mullens
Competition Director