

Ruling Report National Competition

Division : II A

Date : 26 November 2022

Match : BBC 5 – Cercle Perron 6

Open/~~Closed Room~~

Players: NS Nourredine TIFOUS – Eric LEMAIRE (BBC 5)

EW Cécile CAPUTO - Marie-Françoise STAS (Cercle Perron 6)

Board : 19 Dealer : S Vulnerability : EW

Bidding

<p>♠ 9 6 5 4 ♥ A 8 ♦ 6 5 4 ♣ K T 8 3</p>	<p>N W E S</p>	<p>♠ Q 7 ♥ K ♦ A 9 8 2 ♣ Q 9 7 6 5 4</p>	<p>♠ A K 8 2 ♥ 9 7 5 4 ♦ K J 3 ♣ A 2</p>
<p>♠ J T 3 ♥ Q J T 6 3 2 ♦ Q T 7 ♣ J</p>			

West	North	East	South
			2 ♦ ^A
PAS	3 ♣	PAS	Pas
PAS			

Playing

	W	N	E	S	W	N	E
1			♠ A	♠ 3	♠ 5	♠ 7	
2			♠ K				
3			♥ x		♥ A		
4	♦ x		♦ K				
5							
6							
7							
8							
9							
10							
11							
12							
13							

Result and score :

3C-4 by N => 200 for EW (Cercle Perron 6)

Result and score in the other room :

2H= by N => 110 for NS (Cercle Perron 6)

Balance : 310 for Cercle Perron6 = + 7 imp

Result of the match with this board

IMP : 38-56

Result of the match without this board

IMP : 38-49

Remarks from team A (BBC 5)

As said nobody puts a question.

Remarks from team B (Cercle Perron 6)

North alerted 2♦. East looked at the NS convention sheet.

North bids 3♣ (not alerted). East looked at the convention sheet and 3♣ is F1...

If I (East) would have known that 3♣ is not forcing, I would have doubled.

NS agree that in their both heads, it was non-forcing.

Analysis

Following Facts were established by further mailing:

- 3♣ was not alerted by neither North nor South.
- On the convention card of NS 3♣ is erroneously described as "F1". The correct explanation is "6 cartes, limite" and thus non-forcing. NS confirmed this at the table and have shown proof by their system book.
- East only looked at the convention card and reserved her rights before the opening lead. She would have doubled with the correct information.

As East reserved her rights immediately after the pass by South, I'm convinced East would have doubled with the correct information. If EW are damaged as a consequence of its opponents' failure to provide disclosure, they are entitled to rectification through the award of an adjusted score. (L40 B3(a))

Are EW damaged?

If East doubles, South will pass as North is the master of the NS bidding.

What will West bid? A poll of 5 players (3 from Nat1; 2 from Nat2) were given the West hand:

West	North	East	South
			2♦ ^A
?			

Everyone passes on the first round of bidding.

West	North	East	South
			2♦ ^A
P	3♣ (Nat, Limite, NF)	Dbl	P
?			

2 players would pass. 2 players would bid 3S. 1 player would bid 3NT.

East will always pass on 3S. There are 3 possible contracts: 3C*; 3S and 3NT

Double dummy analysis:

- East can only make 3S when the lead of King of hearts is ducked and when diamonds later on are played, declarer has to play the King of diamonds first time (and not finessing the jack). Thus normal expecting result will be equally divided between 2S and 3S.
- EW can only make 1NT.

Calculation of end result (CR: 110 for Cercle Perron 6 (CP6))

Weight	Contract	Balance	Final result
2/5	3C*-4 by N: - 800	910 for CP6 = 14 imps	5,6 imps for CP6
1/5	3S= by E: -110	220 for CP6 = 6 imps	1,2 imps for CP6
1/5	3S-1 by E: +50	60 for CP6 = 2 imps	0,4 imps for CP6
1/5	3NT-2 by E: +100	10 for CP6 = 0 imps	0

- This results in 7,2 imps for Cercle Perron 6. The balance is then rounded to the nearest IMP, thus 7 imps for Cercle Perron 6. This equals the table result, so there is no damage for Cercle Perron 6.

Decision

NS failed to provide full disclosure due to their deficient system card. As there is no damage, EW are not entitled to a rectification of the score. The result on board 19 in the open room is maintained.

The result of the match BBC 5 – Cercle Perron 6 remains 38-56 in IMP or 6,54 – 13,46 in VP.

Additionally, I give a serious warning to the pair Nourredine TIFOUS – Eric LEMAIRE (BBC 5) for their deficient system card. This must be remediated before the next match (10/12/22).

Both teams can file an appeal against this decision. Please refer to the regulations for the treatment of an appeal, which can be consulted on the website of the RBBF.

Done at Deinze on 5 December 2022

Dirk Logghe
Tournament Director for the national competition