

# Ruling Report National Competition

Division : III C

Date : 19 November 2022

Match : Charleroi 4 – Riviera 5

~~Open~~/Closed Room

Players: NS Griet VAN DER MEER – Lieven DE SCHEPPER (Riviera 5)  
EW Gabriel BELSACK - Michel LERAT (Charleroi 4)

Board : 20 Dealer : W Vulnerability : All

Bidding

<p>♠ Q 7 2 ♥ K J 7 3 ♦ 6 4 ♣ K 6 4 2</p>	<p>N W E S</p>	<p>♠ 4 3 ♥ 9 4 2 ♦ 9 8 7 2 ♣ A Q 5 3</p>	<p>♠ A T 8 5 ♥ A Q T ♦ K Q J 5 ♣ J 9</p>
<p>♠ K J 9 6 ♥ 8 6 5 ♦ A T 3 ♣ T 8 7</p>			

West	North	East	South
PAS	PAS	1NT	Pas
2 ♣	PAS	2 ♦	Pas
3NT	PAS	PAS	PAS
PAS			

Playing

	W	N	E	S	W	N	E
1		♠ 6					
2							
3							
4							
5							
6							
7							
8							
9							
10							
11							
12							
13							

Result and score :

3NT= by E => 600 for EW (Charleroi 4)

Result and score in the other room :

3NT -1 by E => 100 for NS (Charleroi 4)

Balance : 700 for Charleroi 4 = + 12 imp

Result of the match with this board

IMP : 77-74

Result of the match without this board

IMP : 65-74

### **Remarks from team A (Charleroi 4)**

Ouest ignore que Est a décidé de jouer le puppet sur 1SA.

La feuille de convention n'indique pas le puppet sur 1SA. Donc Ouest a considéré qu'il n'a pas de majeure 4ème et met 3SA.

### **Remarks from team B (Riviera 5)**

2♣ en 2♦ waren niet gealerteerd (en dus ook geen uitleg) aan beide zijden van het scherm. Start door Zuid gelet op de bieding: ♠6.

Nu blijkt Oost 4 ♠ te hebben terwijl hij 2♦ op 2♣ heeft geboden. Op het einde van het spel merkt Zuid de 4 kaart ♠ op en vraagt uitleg:

- West zegt stayman te spelen.
- Oost zegt dat 2♣ puppet is en dus 2♦ 1 of 2 4 kaarten Majeur is.

Mocht Zuid dit geweten hebben had Zuid nooit schoppen gestart.

Op de conventiekaart staat een onduidelijk antwoord op 1NT (15-17): 2 clubs weak or strong. Dus geen stayman, noch puppet vermeld. Hierdoor kan niet worden nagegaan wat 2♣ - 2♦ nu precies betekent. Verder werd vermeld 2♠ texas mineur. Geen vermelding van texas ♥/♠.

Slotopmerking: Mocht Zuid enige uitleg over wat 2 betekent (majeurs in dit geval) dan ging het contract down omdat Zuid nooit ♠ zou starten. Blijkbaar lichten de tegenstanders toe dat de ene stayman speelt en de andere puppet-stayman. In combinatie met ontbreken van enige info op de conventiekaart voelt Riviera5 zich in deze gift benadeeld.

### **Analysis**

Facts:

- 2♣/2♦ were not alerted by neither East nor West.
- West declares to play Stayman and East thinks to play puppet (Niemayer).

The correct meaning of 2♣ is shown on the convention card: "2 clubs weak or strong".

Several players and an international TD were consulted about the meaning "2 clubs weak or strong". They were all convinced that it meant that EW plays "weak or strong stayman". The partnership agreement has thus been correctly explained by West to South. So there is no infraction at the South/West side of the screen. When the partnership agreement has been explained correctly, there is no infraction and, regardless of damage, the result stands (law 75 C).

According to the alert procedure following bids are alertable:

- 2♣ puppet or niemayer
- Weak stayman has to be mentioned in the pre-alert, otherwise it's alertable.

So both East and West violated the alert rules.

## **Decision**

West made his bids according to the partnership agreement. East deviated from his side's understandings. As there is no infraction, NS are not entitled to a rectification of the score. The result on board 20 in the closed room is maintained.

The result of the match Charleroi 4 – Riviera 5 remains 77-74 in IMP or 10,65 – 9,35 in VP.

Additionally, I give to the EW pair Gabriel BELSACK - Michel LERAT (Charleroi 4) a 1 VP penalty because of system disruption of a basic convention (Stayman) in the first round.

Finally, I give a warning to the pair Gabriel BELSACK - Michel LERAT (Charleroi 4) for their deficient system card. This must be remediated before the next match (03/12/22).

Both teams can file an appeal against this decision. Please refer to the regulations for the treatment of an appeal, which can be consulted on the website of the RBBF.

Done at Deinze on 28 November 2022

Dirk Logghe  
Tournament Director for the national competition