



Royal Belgian
Bridge Federation

Ruling Report National Competition

Division : II B

Date : 29 January 2022

Match : Cercle Perron 6 – Forum 1

Open/~~Closed~~ Room

Players: NS Thomas Monticelli – Romain Monticelli (Cercle Perron 6)

EW Luc Meeuwsen – Ivan Peeters (Forum 1)

Board : 32 Dealer : W Vulnerability : EW

Bidding

<p>♠ J 9 4 ♥ Q 5 3 ♦ J 9 6 2 ♣ K 6 4</p>	<p>N W E S</p>	<p>♠ A 3 2 ♥ 7 4 ♦ 10 5 3 ♣ A J 10 9 5</p> <p>♠ Q 10 7 6 ♥ A J 9 8 6 2 ♦ 7 4 ♣ 7</p> <p>♠ K 8 5 ♥ K 10 ♦ A K Q 8 ♣ Q 8 3 2</p>
------------------------------------------------------	-------------------------------	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

West	North	East	South
Pass	Pass	1 ♥	1 NT
2 ♥	3 NT	Pass	Pass
X	Pass	Pass	Pass

Playing

	W	N	E	S	W	N	E
1	♥ 3	♥ 4	♥ A	♥ 10			
2			♥ 2	♥ K	♥ Q	♥ 7	
3				♣ Q	♣ 4	♣ A	♣ 7
4		♣ J	♦ 7	♣ 2	♣ K		
5	♥ 5	...					
6							
7							
8							
9							
10							
11							
12							
13							

Result and score :

3 NT X **-2** by S → 300 for EW (Forum 1)

Result and score in the other room :

3 NT **+2** by S → 460 for NS (Forum 1)

Balance : 760 for Forum 1 = + 13 IMP

Result of the match with this board

IMP : 74 – 90

Result of the match without this board

IMP : 74 – 77

Remarks from team A (Cercle Perron 6)

Avant de jouer la dame de trèfle, Sud a demandé si une ouverture faible en 3^e main était possible. Ouest a répondu que l'ouverture était à minimum 11 pts.

Sud a donc tenté de prendre le roi de trèfle sec, mais Est avait ouvert d' 1 ♥ avec 7 points.

Remarks from team B (Cercle Perron 4)

De opening in 3^{de} hand was inderdaad erg zwak, maar partner West was duidelijk niet op de hoogte want hij dubbelde 3 NT in volle vertrouwen

Analysis

Was there a mistaken explanation from West or did East deviate from the announced partnership understandings?

On the system card of East-West there is nothing specific mentioned about 3rd hand openings, which means that there is no explicit agreement that this could be weak. However there might be an implicit agreement which then form part of the partnership's methods and must be disclosed in accordance with the regulations. After investigation East and West claimed that they only play exceptionally together. This was confirmed by a thorough research I did, not only of all their competition matches but also of their participation to club tournaments of Forum and the surrounding clubs (Halse, Westrand, Haacht and Zennebridge). Not once did they play together during the last months (from 01/10/21 until now). Consequently I consider it as almost impossible they might have an implicit agreement about 3rd hand openings.

According to Law 40.C a player may deviate from his side's announced understandings, **provided** that his partner has no more reason than the opponents to be aware of the deviation. West was clearly not aware of the deviation as he first bid 2 ♥ and then he doubled 3 NT with only 7 HCP.

There is also something else that needs to be looked at. According to the regulations, if 1 ♥ by agreement can be opened with less than 8 HCP, it is a Yellow system. Here there is no evidence this is an agreement in this partnership. When this player/pair should once more open this light within the near future, the TD should consider this being a habit not disclosed through the system card. But if disclosed it would be considered Yellow, hence not allowed and a score correction would then be appropriate.

Decision

West explained correctly the partnership agreement. East deviated from his side's understandings. As there is no infraction, NS are not entitled to a rectification of the score.

The result on board 32 in the open room is maintained. The result of the match Cercle Perron 6 – Forum 1 remains 74 – 90 in IMP or 6,88 – 13,12 in VP

Both teams can file an appeal against this decision. Please refer to the regulations for the treatment of an appeal, which can be consulted on the website of the RBBF.

Done at Ruisbroek (Puurs-Sint-Amands) on 04 February 2022

Robert Ketels

Tournament Director for the national competition