

# Ruling Report National Competition

Division : Ere                      Date : 13-11-2021

Match : BBC 1 – U.A.E. 1                      Closed Room

Players: NS Sam Bahbout – Mike van der Vorst  
EW Philippe Coenraets - Zvi Engel

Board : 15    Dealer : S    Vulnerability : NS

## Bidding

<p>Board: 15 Dealer: S Vul.: NS</p> <p>♠ 643 ♥ J9 ♦ AK982 ♣ QJ6</p> <p>N ♠ ♥ ♦ ♣ N 2 4 2 1 S 2 4 2 1 E            2 W            1</p>	<p>♠ 972 ♥ 8642 ♦ 7543 ♣ 94</p> <table border="1" style="margin: auto; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr><td> </td><td>N</td><td> </td></tr> <tr><td>W</td><td>/</td><td>E</td></tr> <tr><td> </td><td>S</td><td> </td></tr> </table> <p>♠ AKQ85 ♥ AQ3 ♦ J6 ♣ AK8</p> <p>♠ JT ♥ KT75 ♦ QT ♣ T7532</p> <p>11 HCP    6</p>		N		W	/	E		S		<table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <thead> <tr> <th>West</th> <th>North</th> <th>East</th> <th>South</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr><td> </td><td> </td><td> </td><td>2D</td></tr> <tr><td>X</td><td>XX</td><td>P</td><td>2S</td></tr> <tr><td>P</td><td>3D</td><td>3H</td><td>X</td></tr> <tr><td>P</td><td>4D</td><td>P</td><td>4H</td></tr> <tr><td>P</td><td>5D</td><td>P</td><td>5S</td></tr> <tr><td>P</td><td>6D</td><td>P</td><td>6S</td></tr> <tr><td>P</td><td>P</td><td>P</td><td> </td></tr> <tr><td> </td><td> </td><td> </td><td> </td></tr> </tbody> </table>	West	North	East	South				2D	X	XX	P	2S	P	3D	3H	X	P	4D	P	4H	P	5D	P	5S	P	6D	P	6S	P	P	P					
	N																																														
W	/	E																																													
	S																																														
West	North	East	South																																												
			2D																																												
X	XX	P	2S																																												
P	3D	3H	X																																												
P	4D	P	4H																																												
P	5D	P	5S																																												
P	6D	P	6S																																												
P	P	P																																													

## Playing

	W	N	E	S	W	N	E
1							
2							
3							
4							
5							
6							
7							
8							
9							
10							
11							
12							
13							

Result and score : 6S-2, NS -200

Result and score in the other room :  
4S+1, NS +650

Balance : -850

Result of the match with this board  
35 - 37

Result of the match without this board  
29 - 37

### **Remarks from team BBC 1**

West doubled and explained opening in D, which turned out to be the systematically wrong explanation, it should have been *takeout on hearts*.

### **Remarks from team U.A.E.1**

The 2D opening from South showed some sort of weak bid in hearts or various strong openings. South originally planned to rebid 2NT, showing 24-26 balanced. Because of a lack of diamond stop he bid 2S, explaining it to be 4+S. Normally a 2S bid would show GF in C+D, but apparently South either forgot, or thought it would not be true when the diamond suit is behind him. North had the correct explanation and continued giving preference in D until he gave up. South also claimed that a 2NT rebid would have been GF.

The team did not supply me with a system book, even after several questions.

### **Analysis**

Given the lack of system book I am going to rule based on my understanding of what happened.

West gave the wrong systemic explanation of his bid. With the correct explanation it is virtually certain South would have rebid 2NT. After 2NT it gets more difficult, North has a very bad hand and might well decide to pass. A poll among good players showed a serious percentage of passers.

Now another question is whether law 12C1e comes into play. Isn't the bidding of NS, especially the 2S call of South not a very serious error? In my opinion this error is serious, but maybe not very serious, and furthermore I think it is related to the infraction by W. So I will not use law 12C1e.

### **Decision**

NS 50% of 2NT= and 50% of 4S=

On the first day of the competition an appeal committee gave a penalty of 1 VP to the offending side for insufficient knowledge of their own system. The committee found that system errors at this level are inexcusable especially if it involves a 2-colour game. I am not convinced that this applies in this case (double shows only one colour). Therefore I give only a warning to the pair Philippe Coenraets - Zvi Engel for insufficient knowledge of their own system.

A clear guideline for the TD's from the national appeal commission would be highly appreciated so that penalties can be given on an uniform and known basis.

Both teams can file an appeal against this decision. Please refer to the regulations for the treatment of an appeal, which can be consulted on the website of the RBBF.

Done on 17 November 2021

Hans van Staveren  
Tournament Director