

Ruling Phenix 2 - Riviera 2 (1 Nat) of 12 November 2016

Board 20 W/All

	♠ A Q 7	
	♥ 10 2	
	♦ A 8 6 2	
	♣ 8 5 3 2	
♠ 10 8 2		♠ K J 5 4 3
♥ K 5		♥ Q 9 4
♦ Q 5		♦ K J 10
♣ A K J 9 7 4		♣ 10 6
	♠ 9 6	
	♥ A J 8 7 6 3	
	♦ 9 7 4 3	
	♣ Q	

Bidding

N	E	S	W
			1♣
P	1♥ ^A	P	1♠
P	2♣ ^A	P	3♣
P	3♠	P	3NT

all pass

Facts

The screen is put wrong: North and West are screen mates and so are East and South, whereas North and East (South and West) should be at the same side of the screen.

East's 1♥ bid is alerted on both sides of the screen.

East explains his 2♣ bid as "forcing to ♦", but West does not alert 2♣.

NS's statement: "North did not know that 2♣ "showed something" in ♦, so he led a ♦. If he had known he would have led ♥, because south evidently had to have length in ♥.

EW's statement: "2♣ is indeed relay to 2♦, not showing something in ♦ systematically.

There is indeed a failure to alert but there was no misinformation. We doubt ♥ is an evident lead holding 10 2."

Result: 3NT by West, just made, +600 for EW (Team A)

Result: at the other table 2♠ by East +2, 170 for EW (Team B)

Ruling

West's failure to alert is misinformation (Law 21 B1(a) *Failure to alert promptly where an alert is required by the Regulating Authority is deemed misinformation*).

The question is whether NS are disadvantaged by the wrong information.

None of the four players that were consulted would have led ♥ if they had been given the right information (2♣ is relay to 2♦): North knows that partner cannot have strength as he himself holds 10HP, therefore a lead from a doubleton is quite probably not a good idea.

Decision

The result reached at the table stands.

All players playing with screen are supposed to know the Screens Regulations (players of 1Nat in particular). If East and North had been screen mates both the ruling on board 18 and the one on board 20 had been avoided.

Because of the infraction of the Screens regulations Team A is penalized by 1 VP.

The result of the match **Phenix 2 - Riviera 2** therefore is **11,02-7,98** instead of 12,02-7,98

Paul Meerbergen