

Appeal committee of the RBBF – November 25, 2017

Ruling in question

BCOB3 appeals the decision of the Director (Herman De Wael) taken on board 8 of round 17 when BCOB3 was playing BCOB2 in the Honor Division.

Present

Appeal Committee : Steven De Donder (president), Alain Moulart, Dirk Logghe

BCOB3 : Famarz Bigdeli, Louis-Carl Speleers

BCOB2 : Jean-Francois Jourdain

Facts

See the report by Herman De Wael (not yet on the website)

Appeal of the ruling taken bij the TD

South realized that 3clubs should be alerted (spades and diamonds) after the tray was already pushed to the other side. They tried to get the tray back, but north already made a bid. The players decided to finish the hand and then call the TD. South said he didn't push the tray, west declines he touched the tray. The TD investigated, took his decision and informed the players involved of his decision. He made a report of his ruling. BCOB3 decided to appeal this ruling.

Auditions

The TD was not present so we only had his report.

Jean-Francois Jourdain says he never touches the tray when playing EW. Furthermore he would bid 4 clubs instead of 4hearts with the correct explanation.

Louis-Carl Speleers says it appears to him he didn't push the tray as south.

Famarz Bigdeli says there is an error in the report of the TD. He didn't say that he would always bid 4spades even if west bid 4clubs, he would bid 4 diamonds.

Deliberations

The Appeal Committee noted the following :

- Since we were not present at the table and the TD couldn't find out who pushed the tray, we don't know who pushed the tray and for that we can't do anything.
- If 3 clubs is alerted, west will always bid 4clubs and not 4 hearts
- Over 4 clubs north will bid 4 diamonds and not 4 spades. 4 spades has no sense since he already showed 5-5.
- East has an obvious DBL over 4diamonds holding AK109 in that suit. South passes.
- The TD asked what the players would do after 4spades by north and dbl by east. This is a different situation than 4 diamonds by north and dbl by east since we are below 4hearts.
- The appeal committee thinks that 50% of the players would pass, 50% will still bid 4hearts.

Decisions

The final result of the board becomes as follows :

Result other table : 4H W -2, +100

Result this table :

50% of 4H W -2, +100 (0 IMP/2 = **0**)

50% of 4DX N -2, -300 (9 IMP/2 = **4,5**)

This makes the final result +5 for BCOB2 on this board (rounded towards the team that didn't make the alerting error).

The final result of the match in VP becomes :

BCOB2 15,56

BCOB3 4,44

The caution is returned.